

UDC 502/504:32

Maksim V. Silin, Research Assistant of Centre for Private-Public Interactions at Laboratory of Interdisciplinary Empirical Studies
The Higher School of Economics Perm, 38 Studencheskaya str.,
Perm, 614070, Russia
E-mail: silinmv@gmail.com

Irina V. Romodina, Junior Research Fellow of Centre for Private-Public Interactions at Laboratory of Interdisciplinary Empirical Studies
The Higher School of Economics Perm, 38 Studencheskaya str.,
Perm, 614070, Russia
E-mail: IVRomodina@hse.ru

ECOLOGICAL ASPECTS OF SUSTAINABLE PUBLIC PROCUREMENT IN RUSSIA

The article is dedicated to sustainable public procurement, especially its ecological aspect. The main objective of the study is to conduct diagnostics of sustainable procurement through a practical case in Russia. This research explores the nature of sustainability and more specifically, the study focuses on how the idea of ecologically responsible procurement was represented during the preparation for the Olympic Games in Sochi through tender documentation and official reports.

Olympic Sochi procurement is showcased with the study of two product groups: Transport and Construction. The methodological basis of the research is represented with the analysis of secondary data, collected from public sources (official web sites, contract documentation, official reports, legislative papers) and online interviews with the participants of public procurement of these product groups.

The findings of the research illustrate Olympic Sochi as a case with real examples of green public procurement. Through preparation for Olympics Russian constructing sector and transport industry got new ecological standards, which turned to modern criteria in tender documents for procurement in future public procurement procedures. Thus, a trend towards sustainable development through public procurement will be strong when contracting authorities get a strict prescription to buy “eco-friendly” goods and services.

Key words: *public procurement; sustainable procurement; ecological procurement; Sochi Olympics*

DOI: 10.17072/2218-9173-2016-1-75-89

Introduction

The Russian Federation adopted a sustainable development strategy in 2002. This strategy was later transformed into “Concept of long-term socio-economic development of the Russian Federation for the period till 2020” (hereinafter referred to as “2020 strategy”), which Russia is currently following [3]. One of its main aspects is devoted to “sustainable procurement”, a term which previously had no conventional translation into Russian.

Although other studies have addressed sustainable procurement, none have taken former Soviet countries as a field of study. Generally, sustainable procurement is an integral part of the long-term development strategy. In the present study, we investigate the public procurement sector for a number of reasons.

The public sector spends an average 45–65% of its budget on public procurement, which represents approximately 16% of the gross national product within the European Union [10]. Moreover, the purchasing power of public authorities in Europe is growing. For example, in 2011 this figure reached two trillion Euro [11]. Implementing sustainability practices in public procurement can stimulate the sustainable business-development of a whole country, and make the transition to an innovative economy, which has so much been spoken about lately in Russia.

The main objective of this study is to run diagnostics on sustainable procurement and analyse the legal framework and practice in Russia. Today it is important to evaluate at which point Russian procurement is close to European one, where practices of “green” public procurement are successfully implemented. The Olympic Sochi is the most visible and demonstrative case in which Russia could be compared to Europe. Ecological criteria in public procurement procedures were both the requirement of the International Olympic Committee (IOC) and a self-declaration of the Russian Organising Committee as a host of the most “green” Olympic Games ever. Sochi is also of big interest because Olympic “green” procurement gave birth to a number of industrial standards that are going to be implemented in official requirements for potential suppliers all over the country. The field of sustainable public procurement in Russia has not yet been thoroughly analysed, no academic literature has been written in our country on this topic.

Literature review

Today perhaps all concerns about sustainability come from the idea that has bothered governments all over the world for the last 50 years – sustainable development. Sustainable development is usually defined as “a development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generation to meet their own needs” [17]. It relies on economic, environmental and social dimensions [17]. However, different variations have been suggested. The latest one was given by Magee et al (2013), proposing that sustainable development should be reframed through the lens of four interconnected domains: ecology, economics, politics and culture [8]. Public services are the carriers of sustainable development, and public procurement is one of the mechanisms for this.

Modern literature on public procurement addresses the topic of the so-called “sustainable procurement” more and more often. In March 2011, during the first meeting of the Task Force on Sustainable Public Procurement in Bern, Switzerland, sustainable procurement was defined as the process whereby organizations meet their needs for goods, services, works and utilities in a manner that appreciates in value terms on the basis of life cycle in terms of benefits not only for the organization, but also for society and the economy, while minimizing damage to the environment [14].

In other words, sustainable procurement can be defined as the pursuit of sustainable development objectives through the purchasing and supply process. Sustainable procurement “is consistent with the principles of sustainable development, such as ensuring a strong, healthy and just society, living within environmental limits, and promoting good governance” [18].

In 2004 “Local governments for Sustainability” developed a program called “Procura+” to implement sustainable procurement in the European Union. The sec-

ond edition of the Guide to Cost-Effective Sustainable Public Procurement states that sustainable procurement is smart procurement, meaning “improving the efficiency of public procurement and at the same time using public market power to bring about major environmental and social benefits locally and globally” [12]. In general, sustainable procurement means making sure that the products and services your organization buys have the lowest environmental and most positive social impact.

Basically, this can mean simply making sure you always buy recycled paper or Fair Trade coffee. Broadly speaking, it means systematically integrating environmental and social considerations into all procurement activities, whether purchasing goods, services or works, from defining the true needs of public authorities, to setting appropriate technical specific actions and evaluation procedures, to monitoring performance and results [12].

Sustainable procurement seeks to achieve the appropriate balance between the three pillars of sustainable development i.e. economic, social, and environmental ones (see Table 1).

Table 1

Sustainability in Public Procurement

Economic factors	In the line with good financial management, costs of products and services over their entire life-cycle (Life Cycle Costing), such as: • Acquisition • Maintenance • Operations • End-of-life management costs (including waste disposal)
Social factors	• Social justice and equity • Safety and security • Human rights • Employment conditions
Environmental factors	• Emissions to air, land and water • Climate change • Biodiversity • Natural resource and water use over the whole product life cycle

(Source: EBRD, 2011)

Of course, public bodies, implementing sustainable public procurement (SPP) for the first time, find it difficult to achieve compliance with all the norms. They often allocate environmental or social factors into separate directions. During nearly 15 years of experience, the strongest association of SPP appears to be with being eco-friendly. The organizations responded by conducting conferences and various world-class events under the slogan “green public procurement is our future”. Russia is among the countries that have just started to implement the practice of procuring “green” products and services. Thus, Olympic Sochi has become an experimental platform for implementing new standards for procured goods and services.

Propositions

After the theoretical analysis of literature on SPP a first view on the field of study has been formed. Taking this into account we formulate several propositions.

1. Public authorities and suppliers are not well informed about what sustainable public procurement is.

This proposition is based on the literature, which shows that the issue of sustainable procurement in the world (most of the processes, conventions and organizations started to operate in the XXI century) and particularly in Russia (amendments to the law, sustainable policy vector formed in late 2000s) is young and there are not many sources of information in Russian.

2. During the preparation for the Olympic Games in Sochi the practice of ecological public procurement took place.

Russian authorities announced the Olympics in Sochi to be the most “green” Games ever. It is a common practice in Russia that words of the public figures diverge with deeds. This time the pledge was made in front of a global audience, so statements about sustainability might be true and confirmable.

3. Sustainable public procurement has a future in Russia through the practice of environmentally friendly construction.

The easiest and fastest way to improve sustainable procurement is to include ecological criteria into procurement documentation on a regular basis. Construction is the most promising sector for this, because if the Olympic buildings and objects are built according to “green” standards, construction companies have proper technologies. Public authorities in turn have patterns to procure “green” construction.

Methods

The Olympic Games in Sochi have become the first big-budget project in Russia, which was obliged to meet ecological standards in construction, food and catering, transport, electricity, etc. It was both the requirement of the International Olympic Committee (IOC) and a self-declaration of the Russian Organising Committee as a host of the most “green” Olympic Games ever. It has been an unprecedented event, which accumulated a big number of procurement procedures. They include the latest standards for green construction, eco-friendly buses, criteria for competing firms to have eco-certification, etc. Thus, green procurement in Olympic Sochi has become a case study for this research.

Our analysis was based on two product groups: Transport (Buses) and Construction. The reason is that they have the biggest potential for environmental improvement through green public procurement. This was determined by a range of experts within the European Commission, assessing significant environmental impacts through the product life-cycle, the availability of cost-effective environmentally preferable solutions, and importance of the product within the typical public authority budget [12].

As we aimed to evaluate at which point Russian procurement is close to European in terms of sustainability, we took European guide to cost-effective sustainable public procurement, named “Procura+”, and compared its suggestions for public authority on what to put in tender documentation with what is written in such documentation in Sochi.

The research consisted of two parts. At first, we analyzed tender documents and contracts on the procurement of buses. This documentation was collected from open sources. № 94 and № 44 Federal Laws state the information about placing an order, product specifications, conditions of the competition and other tender documentation to be posted on electronic platforms [1; 4]. We used two of them:

- www.sberbank-ast.ru;
- www.zakupki.gov.ru.

Public procurement for the Olympics was organised mostly through these platforms. Unfortunately, we could not check contract documentation in construction sector, as tenders run by State Corporation “Olympstroy” were organised under special procedures with close access [7]. For that reason, we checked official printed reports of “Olympstroy”, dedicated to “green” construction. In total, we checked three contracts for procuring buses and three official building reports.

For the second part of the research, we ran four unstructured interviews. In line with the explorative nature of the study, the goal of the interviews is “to see the research topic from the perspective of the interviewee and to understand why he or she came to have this particular perspective” [9]. To meet this goal, King (1994) recommends having “a low degree of structure imposed on the interviewer, a preponderance of open questions, a focus on specific situations and action sequences in the world of the interviewee rather than abstractions and general opinions” [6]. We organized unstructured interviews with public procurers and regulatory authorities. The research involved the official representatives from:

- The state corporation “Olympstroy” – organization in charge of building Olympic objects and infrastructure;
- Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Methodology (BREEAM) –certification of the sustainability of Olympic buildings;
- Transport Directorate of the Olympic Games – organization responsible for all transportation of goods, athletes, guests, fans etc;
- GAZ-Group – Official bus supplier.

All interviews were conducted via Skype.

Results

Procurement documentation analysis results

At first we examined documents connected with procuring transport vehicles (cars, buses). The procurement process was organized by public organisation “Transport Directorate of the Olympic Games” (abbreviated TDOG). We have been analysing documentation from two sources: the authorized electronic platform for procurement www.sberbank-ast.ru and the website of the official supplier of the Olympic Games in the category “Buses” – Gaz Group [13].

Procurement of transport was checked according to several ecological criteria. As suggested by “Procura+” manual, we have been focused on three aspects:

- Emission standards;
- Driving style (for public transport);
- Noise emissions.

For the vehicles we check if the specifications in tender documentation match the ecological standards of the aspects shown above. That means:

- Vehicle engines must be certified as meeting the EEV standard for emissions, according to EC Directive 1999/96/EC;
- Vehicles are to be fitted with driving-style meters to monitor fuel usage;
- Vehicle noise emissions must not be higher than 75 dB (A) for vehicles with an engine power between 75–150 kW and 77 dB (A) for vehicles with an engine power above 150 kW.

Table 2 shows whether the ecological aspects of sustainability were presented in tender documentation or not.

Table 2

The Presence of Ecological Aspects

Contracts for the purchase	Aspects of ecological standards					
	Emission standards		Driving style		Noise emissions	
	Required by procurer	Compliance with requirements of "Procura+"	Required by procurer	Compliance with requirements of "Procura+"	Required by procurer	Compliance with requirements of "Procura+"
Buses with high capacity (GOLAZ-6228 Voyage L)	V		V	V	V	V
Low-floor city buses (LIAZ-5292.30)	V		V	V	V	V
Buses to transport people with disabilities (MAZ-103586)	V	V	V	V	V	V

In the left column in brackets we put the names of the buses that won the competition and were procured by TDOG. The aspects of sustainable standards were represented in technical specifications for alleged purchases. We see that two out of three aspects were used in the specifications. Coming to a more detailed analysis, we saw that emission standards were set on the minimal level of EURO-4. But "Procura+" manual suggests the meeting of EEV (Enhanced Environmentally Friendly Vehicles) standard, which means no less than Euro-5 to fit the modern standard of sustainability. Analysing the characteristics of contract winners, we noticed that only documentation from MAZ-103586 match Euro-5 standard.

As for noise emission, Olympic procurer in the documentation requires Russian national standard – GOST R 41.51-2004. Its requirements for "four and more" wheeled vehicles (buses) exactly repeats the maximum permissible values suggested by "Procura+". All the buses that carried participants of the Olympic and Paralympic Games fully comply with European standard for noise emission.

The driving style aspect was also taken into account in tender documentation. Nothing was stated about the presence of driving-style meters, but the technical

specifications require an installed GLONASS module, which has such an option. All the buses delivered in Sochi had this Russian-made module.

Another object of our research is Olympic construction. This is the most demanding area in terms of the application of ecological building standards. This is due to the large amount of resources involved (human, natural, energy) at all stages of the construction process. For this part of the research we looked through the information in official № 5 and № 6 Olympic environmental reports [15], [16]. These materials contain the whole information (except the price of a contract) about the technologies used for building. In the process of examining documentation, we are paying attention mainly to two aspects of “sustainable” construction:

- Energy efficiency (types, sources, consumption);
- The use of eco-friendly building materials.

At first we looked onto the flagship building of the Organizing Committee “Sochi 2014”. This building was one of the first object built in Sochi for the Games, the construction was completed in 2012. The technologies implemented in this building meet the highest European standards of sustainability in building (especially those used by BREEAM). According to № 6 report, in order to decrease the use of thermal power from external networks and with the goal of saving fuel and energy resources for centralized heating, the use of solar energy is provided at the venue to heat water going to the needs of the dining hall and the hot water supply system. On the roof of the left wing of the building 90 sets of vacuum solar receptors were installed [16]. Moreover, this building implemented “Green roof” technology. It provides additional thermal insulation in winter and obstructs the heating of the roof of the building during the summer, which leads to energy being saved in heating and cooling systems respectively [15].

Inside the building lights with LED bulbs are used for lighting hallways that leads to savings of electric energy up to 30% in comparison with ordinary incandescent lamps. Also all faucets in the building are equipped with infrared sensors that automatically regulate the water supply and organize efficient water usage [16]. The material used for building corresponds with the requirements of sustainability, developed by BREEAM. Thus the building is covered with non-flammable, ecological, durable and frost-resistant ceramic plates.

Bolshoy Ice Dome is another examined Olympic venue. This stadium reduces energy consumption in a number of ways. The heat in hot water supply system is produced entirely by reusing heat at the venue, which makes it possible to avoid the use of thermal energy from outside. Also to provide higher energy-efficiency indirect lighting system for lighting the lobby of the building is used.

The materials used during the building process were “eco-friendly” as well as the measures at the construction site. The developing company organized waste segregation as well as recycling and re-using waste from the moment it was generated during construction and installation work. Also the company conducted environmental awareness trainings for employees and contractors.

For this research, we also were interested in buildings for living and decided to check if 4* Apartment-Hotel met the requirements of energy efficiency and ecological building materials. For the confirmation of lowering energy consumption

an innovative solution was used: photoelectric solar modules located on the roof of the hotel. Also technologies like faucets with infrared sensors and led-lightning bulbs help to meet the requirements of energy efficiency.

The materials used for building are stated as eco-friendly. For the first time in Russia the facades and interiors of buildings are made mostly of material of natural origin – wood, stone and recycled material for the upholstery furniture in hotel rooms and the sewing of employee uniform [15]. Also modern artificial heat-insulating materials are used.

Interview outcomes

Four interviews were conducted right after the analysis of secondary data (tender documentation), so the conversation with the interviewees contains questions based on this analysis.

Interviewee № 1

An interview about transport was organized with a specialist from the Department of Procurement in TDOG.

Knowledge about sustainable public procurement

At first, the specialist could not precisely name the components of sustainable procurement, being correct only about environmental (ecological) factor. Having been informed, she could easily explain which ecological criteria they used for procuring buses.

The implication of ecological criteria and standards in tender documentation

The absence of EURO-5 standard requirement was explained with Governmental Resolution № 609 of October 12, 2005 “On the approval of technical regulations on harmful-polluting substances emission requirements for automotive vehicles marketed in the Russian Federation”. According to this document, the EURO-5 standard has become compulsory for public procurement of new transport vehicles beginning from the 1 January, 2014 [2]. The procurement procedures as well as the reparation of technical specification took place in years 2012 and 2013, when EURO-4 was the operating standard. That is the explanation why this criterion differs from the ones suggested by “Procura +”.

The bus-driver’s knowledge about driving in “eco-friendly” mode

Answering the question about fuel usage the specialist said that all the bus-drivers involved in service for the Olympic Games have passed a special training course, which was aimed to teach them driving effectively to reduce fuel consumption. That is what should be done in conjunction with the usage of driving-style meters to show effective results.

Possible barriers for implementing sustainable procurement in Russia

As for the future of sustainable procurement, interviewee from TDOG noted the need for a specific change in FAS (Federal Antimonopoly Service) policy. She explained that with the modern mechanisms of limiting the competition, no sustainable public procurement deal could be carried out. For example, each ecological requirement will be perceived as an attempt to limit competition. That is why the

first thing to do with SPP is to design and implement proper norms and regulations to the legal framework all around the laws about public procurement.

Interviewee № 2

A vast majority of buses (739 buses) were procured for the needs of TDOG from the Russian supplier – GAZ-Group [13]. For the research an interview was conducted with the employee from PR-Department of this auto giant.

Knowledge about sustainable public procurement

The interviewee sees sustainable procurement through reaching ecological standards. Also he added the importance of life cycle evaluation, economical aspect of sustainable procurement. This knowledge depends on the last requirements imposed by the foreign and domestic customers of their car factory.

Ecological characteristics of goods produced and those shipped to Sochi

To meet the requirements for “eco” buses, the factory runs several production lines. Modern buses meet the requirements of Russian GOST standards in all types of emission. But literally Law does not prohibit the procurement of new vehicles with EURO-4 or even EURO-3 by, for example, transport businesses. They still prefer cheaper option to a better environmental effect. That is why some buses are still assembled with old engine requirements. As for Olympic buses, all the requirements for them met the highest standard required at that period of time (EURO-4).

Possible barriers for implementing sustainable procurement in Russia

Asking the supplier about the future of SPP we noted, that he put the financial concern at the forefront. From his point of view, big budgets of global events like Olympic Games or FIFA World Cup give the hosting organizations the ability to care about sustainability, procuring environmentally friendly goods and services and honestly overpaying for them. For ordinary public authority price is still the prevailing criterion, he seeks to save money now, not in the long-run perspective. That is why only subsidiaries from the government can push public buyers towards procurement of more expensive but ecological goods and services.

Interviewee № 3

State company “Olympstroy” as the one which is well informed about all constructing operations has a huge number of staff in “Purchasing department”. One of the employees agreed for an interview for our research.

Knowledge about sustainable public procurement, compliance of Olympic venues with ecological standards

Interviewee easily answered the question about sustainability and its components. She explained that implementation of the principle of sustainable development is stated in newly made Russian national standard GOST R 54964-2012 [5]. This standard was transformed from Olympic corporate green standard and was jointly developed by Centre for Environmental Certifications – green standards (supported by the Ministry of Nature Resource of Russia), the “National Association of Builders – NOSTROY” and “ABOK” (Association of Engineers for Heating Ventilation and Air Conditioning). It is based on the Russian building regulations (GOST and SNiP) with a strong influence from Olympic standard, the BREEAM and LEED benchmarking tools. Approved in 2012 as a voluntary state standard,

it started to operate at the beginning of 2013. All the Olympic venues were built according to this standard and Olympic corporate green standard as well.

Our interlocutor also pointed out that in the framework for preliminary qualification selections placed on the official website, one of the criteria is the following one: “Readiness of the potential executor of a contract to comply with the requirements for certification of environmental management system, as well as to comply with corporate environmental standards “Olympstroy” (http://www.sc-os.ru/ru/concurs/pre_select/). This means every supplier of the Olympic Games if chosen as a winner of tender, will be certified according to a set of sustainable standards.

Sochi’s experience and the spread of ecological construction across the country

Building companies are likely to take part in such global projects like Olympic Games because first of all it is a big contribution to their portfolio. They are creating an image of developing company with modern technologies and view towards sustainable development. That is why green technologies in constructing today is a competitive advantage, so more and more companies will try to implement them. That will boost the whole sector of eco-friendly constructing. That is how the Olympic legacy obviously affects the procurement in this sphere all over the country.

Possible barriers for implementing sustainable procurement in Russia

The representative from the “Olympstroy” sees no barriers in implementing ecological public procurement in building sector. The process of moving towards this kind of procurement has begun with national standard GOST R 54964-2012 coming into power. For now it is improving and becoming more and more like European and American analogues (BREEAM, LEED).

Interviewee № 4

Analysing the constructing sector we also looked for an unprejudiced organization, which could give a view from the outside of Olympic building process. BREEAM (Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Methodology), who certified the Olympic venues, is one of such organizations. One of its specialists who joined the certification commission in Sochi agreed to take part in our research.

Knowledge about sustainable public procurement, certified Olympic venues

Interviewee gave his definition of sustainability and perfectly named its components as this is sphere he currently works in. Speaking about certification process, he began with the fact, that venues were initially designed and planned according to the Russian national standards. That is why not all the newly built Olympic objects fit into European “green” building standards. Initially just 12 venues applied for the BREEAM certification. According to the official information, in total 352 objects were built, so it was about 3% of total number. And not all of them finally got approval. By the end of the Games, six venues were certified:

- Adler Arena;
- Bolshoy Ice Dome;
- Flagship building of Organizing Committee “Sochi 2014”;

- Hotel for IOC (International Olympic Committee);
- Educational and administrative campus of the International Olympic University;
- Olympic Mountain Village.

Interviewee noticed that at this time, Bolshoy Ice Dome is the last to be certificated. The building got the approval in March, 2014. Finally constructed long before the Games, BREEAM articulated additional measures that must be done for the successful certification, and all the alterations were done from the second attempt.

The average quality level of building certified in Russia

The Russian experience in ecological constructing is not that big, that is why today building that apply for certification mostly get the minimum levels of certification ("Pass", "Good"). Organizing committee of the Olympics in Sochi commit themselves to hold the "sustainable" Games and have done their best, but again because of the lack of experience and exaggerated expectations Olympic venues got "Good" ($\geq 45\%$ out of 100%) and "Very Good" rating ($\geq 55\%$ out of 100%). As the buildings certified with "Excellent" ($\geq 70\%$ out of 100%) or "Outstanding" ($\geq 85\%$ out of 100%) rating start to appear in Russia on a regular basis, we will be able to speak about a move towards European levels.

Possible barriers for implementing ecological procurement in Russia

As for the barriers for sustainable procurement in public sector, interviewee says they do exist and form a set of problems. For example, today in Russia there is always no understanding of necessity to introduce the principles of ecological procurement. At the same time, Russian public procuring bodies simply have the lack of qualified personnel, who can competently insert ecological criteria in tender documentation.

Discussion

The actual results of the research correlate much with what we got from the literature review. It is true for both the results of secondary data analysis (procurement documentation, official reports) and interview outcomes. № 94 and № 44 Federal Laws regulate the procurement procedure and content of tender documentation, so the examined data correspond to these Laws. Manual "Procura+" was used as a framework to evaluate the ecological criteria in transport sector. Also the results show us how the basic eco-labeling was reflected in Olympic environmental reports, which provide us with data about ecological procurement in construction sector.

Table 3 below summarizes how the answers from the interviewees help us to reach research objectives.

Taking basic definitions of SPP into account, we came to secondary data analysis. Procurement documentation was scanned for having ecological criteria. Then, to confirm or refute the information collected from documents and reports, we conduct four interviews, asking participants about ecological aspects in public procurement processes. After collecting their answers and combining them with what we got from documentation, we are able to check propositions stated at the very beginning. Through the research we can find out that most of them were supported (see Table 4).

Table 3

Interviewees Answers in the Context of Research Objectives

Research objectives	Propositions	Response of the interviewees			
		№ 1 (TDOG)	№ 2 (GAZ-Group)	№ 3 (Olympstroy)	№ 4 (BREEAM)
Current situation analysis	P1	Not well informed about sustainability; Sees the way standards currently are/should be implemented in documentation	Sees sustainability through ecological aspect; Takes part in trades for “eco” buses	Well informed about sustainability; Include sustainability criteria (mostly ecological) in tender documentation	Excellent knowledge about sustainability
Green public procurement in Olympic Sochi	P2	Bus-drivers are taught to drive in a sustainable mode; Just some buses meet the latest sustainable standards on emission	Deliver buses considered as eco-friendly;	Mostly ecological criteria used, Olympic green standard created	Less than 3% certified; Medium level of compliance to the standards;
Future of SPP in Russia	P3	Contradictions between Law with elements of SPP and FAS policy	Subsidiaries for public authorities from government to procure ecological goods and services	No barriers in construction sector, Law obliges to use green standard	Need more qualified personnel; Informing population about the necessity of SPP

Results of Propositions

Propositions	Content	Result
P1	State buyers as well as suppliers are not well informed about what sustainable public procurement is	Not Supported
P2	During the preparation for the Games in Sochi the practice of sustainable public procurement took place	Supported
P3	Sustainable public procurement has future in the Russian Federation through practice of environmentally friendly constructing	Supported

The fact that 3 out of 4 interviewees could explain the correct meaning of sustainable development and procurement does not support our propositions, gives us a clue that this study has limitations, especially that the number of sample is too small to create really reliable results.

As both documentation and interviews gave us evidences of the use of ecological criteria, we can assert that the case of Sochi really showed the sustainability procurement for the Games, at least in the analysed categories. This result is another limitation of the research: we checked just two product groups (transport and construction). Choosing, for example, food, may lead to a different result.

Asking interviewees for the barriers of implementing sustainable procurement, we expect them to show the direction Russian government should think in, if it wants to bring sustainable procurement to common practice. We got the suggestions like policy changing, financial support, personnel trainings and informational support.

Thus, the compliance of our propositions with the results that we got throws light on the scope of our research. The main objective, namely conducting diagnostics of sustainable public procurement in Olympic Sochi, has been achieved. Sochi case probably showed a new vector of public procurement in Russia. Ecological criteria for Olympics evolved in a new GOST. The same applies to new petrol standards. Happily, Russia got the right to host big events in observable future: FIFA World Cup - 2018, Winter Universiade – 2019 (Krasnoyarsk), World Skills – 2019 (Kazan). With constantly raising international “green” standards, many new criteria will be introduced in tender documentation and later on become obligatory for public procurers in the whole country.

Received 16 November 2015

References

1. Consultant (2005), *O razmeshenii zakazov na postavki tovarov, vipolnenie rabot, okazanie uslug dlia gosudarstvennih i munitsipalnih nuzd* [On placement of orders for delivery of goods, performance of works and rendering services for state and municipal needs], Federal Law no. 94-FZ dated 27 July 2005, available at: https://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_54598/ (Accessed 12 November 2015).

2. Consultant (2005), *Ob utverzhdenii tehnikeskogo reglamenta 'O trebovaniyah k vibrosam avtomobilnoy tekhniko, vipuskaemoy v obrashenie na teritorii Rossiyskoy Federacii, vrednuh (zagriazniaushih) veshestv'* [On the approval of technical regulations on harmful-polluting substances emission requirements for automotive vehicles marketed in the Russian Federation], Governmental Resolution of the Russian Federation no. 609 dated 12 October 2005, available at: http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_56061/ (Accessed 12 November 2015).
3. Consultant (2008), *O kontseptsii dolgosrochnogo socialno-ekonomicheskogo razvitiya Rossiyskoy Federacii na period do 2020 goda* [On the Concept of long-term socio-economic development of the Russian Federation for the period till 2020], Order of Government of the Russian Federation no. 1662-r dated 17 November 2008, available at: http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_82134/ (Accessed 12 November 2015).
4. Consultant (2013), *O kontraktnoy sisteme v sfere zakupok tovarov, rabot, uslug dlia obespecheniya gosudarstvennyh i munitsipalnih nuzd* [On contract system in state and municipal procurement of goods, works and services for state and municipal needs], Federal Law no. 44-FZ dated 5 April 2013, available at: https://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_144624/ (Accessed 12 November 2015).
5. Federal Agency for Technical Regulation and Metrology (2012), *GOST R 54964-2012. Otsenka sootvetstviya. Ekologicheskie trebovaniya k ob'ektam nedvizimosti* [GOST R 54964-2012. Conformity assessment. Environmental requirements for real estate objects], Standartinform, Moscow, Russia.
6. King, N. (1994), "Qualitative Methods in Organizational Research: A Practical Guide", *The Qualitative Research Interview*, Special Issue, pp. 14–36.
7. Levko, D. (2014), "Who and How Contributed to the Games in Sochi-2014", [Online], available at: <http://rbcdaily.ru/sport/562949990432622> (Accessed 8 August 2015).
8. Magee, L., Scerri, A., James, P., Thom, J.A., Padgham, L., Hickmott, S., Deng, H. and Cahill, F. (2013), "Reframing Social Sustainability Reporting: Towards an Engaged Approach", *Environment Development and Sustainability*, vol. 15, no. 1, pp. 225–243.
9. Meyer, C.B. (2001), "A Case in Case Study Methodology", *Field Methods*, vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 329–352.
10. The official site of the European Commission (2009), "Collection of statistical information on Green Public Procurement in the EU", available at: http://ec.europa.eu/environment/gpp/pdf/statistical_information.pdf (Accessed 8 August 2015).
11. The official site of the European Commission (2011), "Buying Green! A Handbook on Green Public Procurement", available at: http://ec.europa.eu/environment/gpp/buying_handbook_en.htm (Accessed 8 September 2015).
12. The official site of the European Sustainable Procurement Network (2007), "A Guide to Cost-Effective Sustainable Public Procurement", available at: http://www.procuraplus.org/fileadmin/files/Manuals/English_manual/1_-_Procura_Manual_complete.pdf (Accessed 11 November 2015).
13. The official site of the Gaz-Group (2015), "Olympic Sochi Buses", available at: http://gazgroup.ru/project_sochi_2014/ (Accessed 12 November 2015).
14. The official site of the ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability

(2015), “Sustainable Public Procurement”, available at: <http://www.iclei.org/iclei-global/who-is-iclei.html> (Accessed 8 August 2015).

15. The official site of the Russian Green Building Council (2012), “Implementing ‘Green’ Building Standards. 5th Report”, available at: <http://www.rugbc.org/en/resources/green-building-guides> (Accessed 12 November 2015).

16. The official site of the Russian Green Building Council (2013), “Implementing ‘Green’ Building Standards. 6th Report”, available at: <http://www.rugbc.org/en/resources/green-building-guides> (Accessed 12 November 2015).

17. The official site of the United Nations (1987), “Report of the World Commission on Environment and Development”, available at: <http://www.un.org/documents/ga/res/42/ares42-187.htm> (Accessed 11 November 2015).

18. Walker, H. and Brammer, S. (2009), “Sustainable Procurement in the United Kingdom Public Sector”, *Supply Chain Management: An International Journal*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 128–137.

**М.В. Силин, стажер-исследователь сектора исследований
государственно-частного взаимодействия**

Научно-учебной лаборатории междисциплинарных эмпирических исследований
Пермский филиал ФГАОУ ВО «Национальный исследовательский университет «Высшая школа
экономики», г. Пермь, ул. Студенческая, 38
Электронный адрес: silinmv@gmail.com

**И.В. Ромодина, младший научный сотрудник сектора исследований
государственно-частного взаимодействия**

Научно-учебной лаборатории междисциплинарных эмпирических исследований
Пермский филиал ФГАОУ ВО «Национальный исследовательский университет «Высшая школа
экономики», г. Пермь, ул. Студенческая, 38
Электронный адрес: IVRomodina@hse.ru

ЭКОЛОГИЧЕСКИЕ АСПЕКТЫ УСТОЙЧИВЫХ ГОСУДАРСТВЕННЫХ ЗАКУПОК В РОССИИ

Статья посвящена исследованию устойчивых государственных закупок в России. В частности, авторы рассматривают экологические аспектыкупаемых государством товаров и услуг на примере прошедших Олимпийских Игр в г. Сочи. В исследовании использовались преимущественно качественные методы: анализ закупочной документации, официальных материалов, проведение интервью с участниками процесса закупок и сертификации. Результаты исследования показывают присутствие «зеленых» государственных закупок в исследованных сферах, а именно в строительстве и транспорте. Было выявлено, что именно через «зеленые» закупки на этапе подготовки к Олимпийским Играм Россия получила новые экологические стандарты, которые впоследствии стали критериями в закупочной документации на определенные товарные группы. Авторы приходят к выводу, что устойчивое развитие через экологические государственные закупки в России возможно в случае, если закупщиков обяжут покупать товары с соответствующими характеристиками.

Ключевые слова: устойчивые государственные закупки; экологические закупки; зеленые закупки в Сочи; Олимпийские игры в Сочи